

1 PAUL L. REIN, Esq. (SBN 43053)  
2 PATRICIA BARBOSA, Esq. (SBN 125865)  
3 JULIE MCLEAN, Esq. (SBN 215202)  
4 LAW OFFICES OF PAUL L. REIN  
5 200 Lakeside Drive, Suite A  
6 Oakland, CA 94612  
7 (510) 832-5001

8  
9 Attorneys for Plaintiff  
10 BRIAN BOLITHO

11  
12  
13 UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
14 NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA

15 BRIAN BOLITHO

16 CASE NO.

17 Plaintiff,

18 Civil Rights

19 v.

20  
21 VALLEY RADIOLOGY MEDICAL  
22 ASSOCIATES, INC.; SOUTH DRIVE  
23 MEDICAL ASSOCIATES, INC.; PIO V.  
24 DEFEO; MARIA E. DEFEO; and DOES  
25 1-25, Inclusive,

26 Defendants.

27  
28  
29  
30  
31  
32  
33  
34  
35  
36  
37  
38  
39  
40  
41  
42  
43  
44  
45  
46  
47  
48  
49  
50  
51  
52  
53  
54  
55  
56  
57  
58  
59  
60  
61  
62  
63  
64  
65  
66  
67  
68  
69  
70  
71  
72  
73  
74  
75  
76  
77  
78  
79  
80  
81  
82  
83  
84  
85  
86  
87  
88  
89  
90  
91  
92  
93  
94  
95  
96  
97  
98  
99  
100  
101  
102  
103  
104  
105  
106  
107  
108  
109  
110  
111  
112  
113  
114  
115  
116  
117  
118  
119  
120  
121  
122  
123  
124  
125  
126  
127  
128  
129  
130  
131  
132  
133  
134  
135  
136  
137  
138  
139  
140  
141  
142  
143  
144  
145  
146  
147  
148  
149  
150  
151  
152  
153  
154  
155  
156  
157  
158  
159  
160  
161  
162  
163  
164  
165  
166  
167  
168  
169  
170  
171  
172  
173  
174  
175  
176  
177  
178  
179  
180  
181  
182  
183  
184  
185  
186  
187  
188  
189  
190  
191  
192  
193  
194  
195  
196  
197  
198  
199  
200  
201  
202  
203  
204  
205  
206  
207  
208  
209  
210  
211  
212  
213  
214  
215  
216  
217  
218  
219  
220  
221  
222  
223  
224  
225  
226  
227  
228  
229  
230  
231  
232  
233  
234  
235  
236  
237  
238  
239  
240  
241  
242  
243  
244  
245  
246  
247  
248  
249  
250  
251  
252  
253  
254  
255  
256  
257  
258  
259  
260  
261  
262  
263  
264  
265  
266  
267  
268  
269  
270  
271  
272  
273  
274  
275  
276  
277  
278  
279  
280  
281  
282  
283  
284  
285  
286  
287  
288  
289  
290  
291  
292  
293  
294  
295  
296  
297  
298  
299  
300  
301  
302  
303  
304  
305  
306  
307  
308  
309  
310  
311  
312  
313  
314  
315  
316  
317  
318  
319  
320  
321  
322  
323  
324  
325  
326  
327  
328  
329  
330  
331  
332  
333  
334  
335  
336  
337  
338  
339  
340  
341  
342  
343  
344  
345  
346  
347  
348  
349  
350  
351  
352  
353  
354  
355  
356  
357  
358  
359  
360  
361  
362  
363  
364  
365  
366  
367  
368  
369  
370  
371  
372  
373  
374  
375  
376  
377  
378  
379  
380  
381  
382  
383  
384  
385  
386  
387  
388  
389  
390  
391  
392  
393  
394  
395  
396  
397  
398  
399  
400  
401  
402  
403  
404  
405  
406  
407  
408  
409  
410  
411  
412  
413  
414  
415  
416  
417  
418  
419  
420  
421  
422  
423  
424  
425  
426  
427  
428  
429  
430  
431  
432  
433  
434  
435  
436  
437  
438  
439  
440  
441  
442  
443  
444  
445  
446  
447  
448  
449  
450  
451  
452  
453  
454  
455  
456  
457  
458  
459  
460  
461  
462  
463  
464  
465  
466  
467  
468  
469  
470  
471  
472  
473  
474  
475  
476  
477  
478  
479  
480  
481  
482  
483  
484  
485  
486  
487  
488  
489  
490  
491  
492  
493  
494  
495  
496  
497  
498  
499  
500  
501  
502  
503  
504  
505  
506  
507  
508  
509  
510  
511  
512  
513  
514  
515  
516  
517  
518  
519  
520  
521  
522  
523  
524  
525  
526  
527  
528  
529  
530  
531  
532  
533  
534  
535  
536  
537  
538  
539  
540  
541  
542  
543  
544  
545  
546  
547  
548  
549  
550  
551  
552  
553  
554  
555  
556  
557  
558  
559  
5510  
5511  
5512  
5513  
5514  
5515  
5516  
5517  
5518  
5519  
5520  
5521  
5522  
5523  
5524  
5525  
5526  
5527  
5528  
5529  
55210  
55211  
55212  
55213  
55214  
55215  
55216  
55217  
55218  
55219  
55220  
55221  
55222  
55223  
55224  
55225  
55226  
55227  
55228  
55229  
55230  
55231  
55232  
55233  
55234  
55235  
55236  
55237  
55238  
55239  
55240  
55241  
55242  
55243  
55244  
55245  
55246  
55247  
55248  
55249  
55250  
55251  
55252  
55253  
55254  
55255  
55256  
55257  
55258  
55259  
55260  
55261  
55262  
55263  
55264  
55265  
55266  
55267  
55268  
55269  
55270  
55271  
55272  
55273  
55274  
55275  
55276  
55277  
55278  
55279  
55280  
55281  
55282  
55283  
55284  
55285  
55286  
55287  
55288  
55289  
55290  
55291  
55292  
55293  
55294  
55295  
55296  
55297  
55298  
55299  
552100  
552101  
552102  
552103  
552104  
552105  
552106  
552107  
552108  
552109  
552110  
552111  
552112  
552113  
552114  
552115  
552116  
552117  
552118  
552119  
552120  
552121  
552122  
552123  
552124  
552125  
552126  
552127  
552128  
552129  
552130  
552131  
552132  
552133  
552134  
552135  
552136  
552137  
552138  
552139  
552140  
552141  
552142  
552143  
552144  
552145  
552146  
552147  
552148  
552149  
552150  
552151  
552152  
552153  
552154  
552155  
552156  
552157  
552158  
552159  
552160  
552161  
552162  
552163  
552164  
552165  
552166  
552167  
552168  
552169  
552170  
552171  
552172  
552173  
552174  
552175  
552176  
552177  
552178  
552179  
552180  
552181  
552182  
552183  
552184  
552185  
552186  
552187  
552188  
552189  
552190  
552191  
552192  
552193  
552194  
552195  
552196  
552197  
552198  
552199  
552200  
552201  
552202  
552203  
552204  
552205  
552206  
552207  
552208  
552209  
552210  
552211  
552212  
552213  
552214  
552215  
552216  
552217  
552218  
552219  
552220  
552221  
552222  
552223  
552224  
552225  
552226  
552227  
552228  
552229  
5522210  
5522211  
5522212  
5522213  
5522214  
5522215  
5522216  
5522217  
5522218  
5522219  
5522220  
5522221  
5522222  
5522223  
5522224  
5522225  
5522226  
5522227  
5522228  
5522229  
55222210  
55222211  
55222212  
55222213  
55222214  
55222215  
55222216  
55222217  
55222218  
55222219  
55222220  
55222221  
55222222  
55222223  
55222224  
55222225  
55222226  
55222227  
55222228  
55222229  
552222210  
552222211  
552222212  
552222213  
552222214  
552222215  
552222216  
552222217  
552222218  
552222219  
552222220  
552222221  
552222222  
552222223  
552222224  
552222225  
552222226  
552222227  
552222228  
552222229  
5522222210  
5522222211  
5522222212  
5522222213  
5522222214  
5522222215  
5522222216  
5522222217  
5522222218  
5522222219  
5522222220  
5522222221  
5522222222  
5522222223  
5522222224  
5522222225  
5522222226  
5522222227  
5522222228  
5522222229  
55222222210  
55222222211  
55222222212  
55222222213  
55222222214  
55222222215  
55222222216  
55222222217  
55222222218  
55222222219  
55222222220  
55222222221  
55222222222  
55222222223  
55222222224  
55222222225  
55222222226  
55222222227  
55222222228  
55222222229  
552222222210  
552222222211  
552222222212  
552222222213  
552222222214  
552222222215  
552222222216  
552222222217  
552222222218  
552222222219  
552222222220  
552222222221  
552222222222  
552222222223  
552222222224  
552222222225  
552222222226  
552222222227  
552222222228  
552222222229  
5522222222210  
5522222222211  
5522222222212  
5522222222213  
5522222222214  
5522222222215  
5522222222216  
5522222222217  
5522222222218  
5522222222219  
5522222222220  
5522222222221  
5522222222222  
5522222222223  
5522222222224  
5522222222225  
5522222222226  
5522222222227  
5522222222228  
5522222222229  
55222222222210  
55222222222211  
55222222222212  
55222222222213  
55222222222214  
55222222222215  
55222222222216  
55222222222217  
55222222222218  
55222222222219  
55222222222220  
55222222222221  
55222222222222  
55222222222223  
55222222222224  
55222222222225  
55222222222226  
55222222222227  
55222222222228  
55222222222229  
552222222222210  
552222222222211  
552222222222212  
552222222222213  
552222222222214  
552222222222215  
552222222222216  
552222222222217  
552222222222218  
552222222222219  
552222222222220  
552222222222221  
552222222222222  
552222222222223  
552222222222224  
552222222222225  
552222222222226  
552222222222227  
552222222222228  
552222222222229  
5522222222222210  
5522222222222211  
5522222222222212  
5522222222222213  
5522222222222214  
5522222222222215  
5522222222222216  
5522222222222217  
5522222222222218  
5522222222222219  
5522222222222220  
5522222222222221  
5522222222222222  
5522222222222223  
5522222222222224  
5522222222222225  
5522222222222226  
5522222222222227  
5522222222222228  
5522222222222229  
55222222222222210  
55222222222222211  
55222222222222212  
55222222222222213  
55222222222222214  
55222222222222215  
55222222222222216  
55222222222222217  
55222222222222218  
55222222222222219  
55222222222222220  
55222222222222221  
55222222222222222  
55222222222222223  
55222222222222224  
55222222222222225  
55222222222222226  
55222222222222227  
55222222222222228  
55222222222222229  
552222222222222210  
552222222222222211  
552222222222222212  
552222222222222213  
552222222222222214  
552222222222222215  
552222222222222216  
552222222222222217  
552222222222222218  
552222222222222219  
552222222222222220  
552222222222222221  
552222222222222222  
552222222222222223  
552222222222222224  
552222222222222225  
552222222222222226  
552222222222222227  
552222222222222228  
552222222222222229  
5522222222222222210  
5522222222222222211  
5522222222222222212  
5522222222222222213  
5522222222222222214  
5522222222222222215  
5522222222222222216  
5522222222222222217  
5522222222222222218  
5522222222222222219  
5522222222222222220  
5522222222222222221  
5522222222222222222  
5522222222222222223  
5522222222222222224  
5522222222222222225  
5522222222222222226  
5522222222222222227  
5522222222222222228  
5522222222222222229  
55222222222222222210  
55222222222222222211  
55222222222222222212  
55222222222222222213  
55222222222222222214  
55222222222222222215  
55222222222222222216  
55222222222222222217  
55222222222222222218  
55222222222222222219  
55222222222222222220  
55222222222222222221  
55222222222222222222  
55222222222222222223  
55222222222222222224  
55222222222222222225  
55222222222222222226  
55222222222222222227  
55222222222222222228  
55222222222222222229  
552222222222222222210  
552222222222222222211  
552222222222222222212  
552222222222222222213  
552222222222222222214  
552222222222222222215  
552222222222222222216  
552222222222222222217  
552222222222222222218  
552222222222222222219  
552222222222222222220  
552222222222222222221  
552222222222222222222  
552222222222222222223  
552222222222222222224  
552222222222222222225  
552222222222222222226  
552222222222222222227  
552222222222222222228  
552222222222222222229  
5522222222222222222210  
5522222222222222222211  
5522222222222222222212  
5522222222222222222213  
5522222222222222222214  
5522222222222222222215  
5522222222222222222216  
5522222222222222222217  
5522222222222222222218  
5522222222222222222219  
5522222222222222222220  
5522222222222222222221  
5522222222222222222222  
5522222222222222222223  
5522222222222222222224  
5522222222222222222225  
5522222222222222222226  
5522222222222222222227  
5522222222222222222228  
5522222222222222222229  
55222222222222222222210  
55222222222222222222211  
55222222222222222222212  
55222222222222222222213  
55222222222222222222214  
55222222222222222222215  
55222222222222222222216  
55222222222222222222217  
55222222222222222222218  
55222222222222222222219  
55222222222222222222220  
55222222222222222222221  
55222222222222222222222  
55222222222222222222223  
55222222222222222222224  
55222222222222222222225  
55222222222222222222226  
55222222222222222222227  
55222222222222222222228  
55222222222222222222229  
552222222222222222222210  
552222222222222222222211  
552222222222222222222212  
552222222222222222222213  
552222222222222222222214  
552222222222222222222215  
552222222222222222222216  
552222222222222222222217  
552222222222222222222218  
552222222222222222222219  
552222222222222222222220  
552222222222222222222221  
552222222222222222222222  
552222222222222222222223  
552222222222222222222224  
552222222222222222222225  
552222222222222222222226  
552222222222222222222227  
552222222222222222222228  
552222222222222222222229  
552222222222222222

1 violation of Title III of the Americans with Disabilities Act  
 2 of 1990 and California civil rights laws and regulations, and  
 3 hereby more particularly alleges as follows:

4

5 **FIRST CAUSE OF ACTION:**  
**DAMAGES AND INJUNCTIVE RELIEF FOR DENIAL OF FULL AND EQUAL**  
**ACCESS TO A PLACE OF PUBLIC ACCOMMODATION**  
**(Civil Code §§ 54, 54.1, et seq.; Health & Safety Code §§ 19953**  
 7 **and 19955 et seq.)**

8 1. Plaintiff BRIAN BOLITHO is a "person with a  
 9 disability" or "physically handicapped person". Plaintiff  
 10 requires the use of a wheelchair for locomotion and is unable  
 11 to use portions of public facilities which are not accessible  
 12 to disabled persons who require the use of a wheelchair.

13 2. **SUMMARY:** This case involves the denial of accessible  
 14 facilities to Plaintiff BRIAN BOLITHO at two locations of the  
 15 Valley Radiology chain, located at 285 South Drive, #5,  
 16 Mountain View, California; and 451 Sherman Ave., #110, Palo  
 17 Alto, California. BRIAN BOLITHO was denied his civil rights  
 18 under both California law and federal law, to full and equal  
 19 access at these facilities because they were not, and are not  
 20 now, properly accessible to physically disabled persons who use  
 21 wheelchairs. Plaintiff BRIAN BOLITHO is deterred from  
 22 returning to these facilities to receive medical services until  
 23 such time as the facilities are made fully accessible and  
 24 defendants' discriminatory policies are modified. Plaintiff  
 25 seeks injunctive relief to require defendants to make their  
 26 facilities accessible to disabled persons, and to ensure that  
 27 all disabled patrons will be provided accessible entrance,  
 28 restroom facilities, medical diagnostic equipment, and other

1 public facilities, as required by law; and to require  
 2 defendants to modify their policies and procedures to provide  
 3 their services to disabled persons such as plaintiff. In the  
 4 alternative, plaintiff seeks to enjoin each of the subject  
 5 facilities from operating as a place of "public accommodation"  
 6 or "business establishment" which discriminates against  
 7 plaintiff and other persons with disabilities. Plaintiff also  
 8 seeks recovery of damages for his personal injuries and  
 9 discriminatory experiences and for the continuing day-to-day  
 10 denial of access which results from defendants' failure to  
 11 provide accessible facilities. Plaintiff BRIAN BOLITHO also  
 12 seeks recovery of statutory attorney fees, litigation expenses  
 13 and costs, under federal law and California law.

14       3. **JURISDICTION:** This Court has jurisdiction of this  
 15 action pursuant to 28 USC §1331 for violations of Title III of  
 16 the Americans with Disabilities Act of 1990, 42 USC §12101 et  
 17 seq. Pursuant to pendant jurisdiction, attendant and related  
 18 causes of action arising from the same facts are also brought  
 19 under California law, including but not limited to violations  
 20 of California Civil Code §§ 51, 52, 54, 54.1 and 55;  
 21 California Health & Safety Code §19955 et seq., including  
 22 §19959; and California Code of Regulations Title 24-2  
 23 (hereinafter "Title 24").

24       4. **VENUE:** Venue is proper in this court pursuant to 28  
 25 USC 1391(b) because the subject property is located in this  
 26 district and plaintiff's causes of action arose here.

27       ///

28       ///

1       5.   **INTRADISTRICT:** This case should be assigned to the  
 2 San Jose intradistrict, where the subject property is located  
 3 and where plaintiff's causes of action arose.

4       6.   **PARTIES:** Plaintiff BRIAN BOLITHO is a "qualified"  
 5 physically disabled person who cannot walk due to paraplegia as  
 6 a result of a spinal injury, and who requires use of a  
 7 wheelchair. VALLEY RADIOLOGY MEDICAL ASSOCIATES, INC.; SOUTH  
 8 DRIVE MEDICAL ASSOCIATES, INC.; and DOES 1-12, Inclusive, are  
 9 the owners, operators, lessors, and lessees of the property,  
 10 building and facilities located at 285 South Drive, #5,  
 11 Mountain View, California. VALLEY RADIOLOGY MEDICAL  
 12 ASSOCIATES, INC.; PIO V. DEFEO; MARIA E. DEFEO; and DOES 13-25,  
 13 Inclusive, are the owners, operators, lessors and lessees of  
 14 the property, building and facilities located at 451 Sherman  
 15 Ave. #110, Palo Alto, California. These locations are operated  
 16 as medical imaging offices and each is a "public accommodation"  
 17 and "business entity" subject to the requirements of California  
 18 Health & Safety Code §19955 et seq. and of California Civil  
 19 Code §51, §54 and §54.1, et seq. On information and belief,  
 20 such facilities have, since July 1, 1970, undergone  
 21 construction and/or "alterations, structural repairs, or  
 22 additions," subjecting all such buildings and facilities to  
 23 disabled access requirements pursuant to Health & Safety Code  
 24 §19953-19959, et seq.

25       7. The true names and capacities of Defendants Does 1  
 26 through 25, Inclusive, are unknown to plaintiff who therefore  
 27 sues said defendants by such fictitious names. Plaintiff is  
 28 informed and believes that each of the defendants herein

1 designated as a Doe is legally responsible in some manner for  
 2 the events and happenings herein referred to and caused injury  
 3 and damages proximately thereby to plaintiff; plaintiff prays  
 4 leave of Court to amend this Complaint to show such true names  
 5 and capacities when the same have been ascertained.

6       8. Defendants VALLEY RADIOLOGY MEDICAL ASSOCIATES, INC.;  
 7 SOUTH DRIVE MEDICAL ASSOCIATES, INC.; PIO V. DEFEO; MARIA E.  
 8 DEFEO; and DOES 1-25, Inclusive, are and were the owners,  
 9 operators, lessors and lessees of the subject properties,  
 10 buildings, and facilities at all relevant times. Plaintiff is  
 11 informed and believes that each of the defendants herein is the  
 12 agent, employee or representative of each of the other  
 13 defendants, and performed all acts and omissions stated herein  
 14 within the scope of such agency or employment or representative  
 15 capacity and is responsible in some manner for the acts and  
 16 omissions of the other defendants in proximately causing the  
 17 damages complained of herein.

18       9. Plaintiff BRIAN BOLITHO and other similarly situated  
 19 physically disabled persons, including those who require the  
 20 use of a wheelchair, are unable to use public facilities on a  
 21 "full and equal" basis unless each such facility is in  
 22 compliance with the relevant provisions of California Building  
 23 Codes and statutes. Plaintiff is a member of that portion of  
 24 the public whose rights are protected by the provisions of Cal.  
 25 Civil Code §§ 51, 52, 54, and 54.1.

26       10. **STATUTORY PROVISIONS:** California Civil Code §54.1  
 27 states that individuals with disabilities are:  
 28 "entitled to full and equal access, as other members of the  
 general public, to accommodations, advantages,

1 facilities...places of public accommodations, amusement, or  
 2 resort, and other places to which the general public is  
 3 invited, subject only to the conditions and limitations  
 4 established by law...and applicable alike to all persons."

5 Health & Safety Code §§ 19955 and 19955.5 were enacted "To  
 6 ensure that public accommodations or facilities constructed in  
 7 this state with private funds adhere to the provisions of  
 8 Chapter 7 (commencing with §4450) of Division 5 of Title 1 of  
 9 the Government Code." Section 19955 also requires that "When  
 10 sanitary facilities are made available for the public, clients,  
 11 or employees... they shall be made available for persons with  
 12 disabilities." California Code of Regulations, Title 24-2 was  
 13 in effect at the time of each alteration which occurred at such  
 14 public facility since July 1, 1982, additionally requiring  
 15 access complying with the specifications of Title 24-2 whenever  
 16 any construction, "alteration, structural repair or addition"  
 17 was performed. Further, any construction, alterations,  
 18 structural repairs, or additions which occurred between July 1,  
 19 1970 and July 1, 1982, required compliance with disabled access  
 20 standards pursuant to American Standards Association  
 21 Specifications ("ANSI"). All such constructions and/or  
 22 alterations were carried out by the current defendant owners or  
 23 operators, or by their predecessors in interest, whose acts and  
 24 omissions are the continuing and current responsibility of all  
 25 current owners, operators, lessors and lessees.

25

26 **FACTUAL STATEMENT**

27

28 11. In January of 2004, plaintiff BRIAN BOLITHO was  
 involved in an automobile accident, during which he suffered

1 torn arm muscles and dislocation of his arm joints at the  
 2 elbows and shoulders. After his treatment and release from the  
 3 emergency room, he made an appointment with his primary care  
 4 doctor, who ordered an MRI. His primary care doctor's office  
 5 set up an appointment for plaintiff to have an MRI at Valley  
 6 Radiology in Mountain View, California. In preparation for  
 7 this appointment, a staff member from Valley Radiology in  
 8 Mountain View called plaintiff to make a preliminary  
 9 appointment for him to get checked for metal in his body before  
 10 he could have the MRI, since metal in or on the body interferes  
 11 with the MRI procedure. Plaintiff made arrangements to go to  
 12 Valley Radiology in Mountain View for such a checkup.

13 12. On or about January 13, 2004, plaintiff was about to  
 14 go to his preliminary appointment at Valley Radiology in  
 15 Mountain View when a technician from that office telephoned  
 16 him. She said that she had just realized from reviewing his  
 17 file that he was a wheelchair user. She further told plaintiff  
 18 that because he was a wheelchair user, her office could not see  
 19 him, could not serve him, and he should not even go to the  
 20 office. He therefore did not go to Valley Radiology in  
 21 Mountain View and was deterred from going to this location.

22 13. A few days later, on or about January 22, 2004,  
 23 plaintiff learned that there was another Valley Radiology  
 24 location in Palo Alto, only a few blocks from his home. He  
 25 decided to visit that facility to see if he would be able to  
 26 get his MRI there. He went to the facility that same day,  
 27 entered, and asked if he would be able to make an appointment  
 28 to get an MRI, and explained that he had a doctor's referral to

1 Valley Radiology for an MRI. The employee at Valley Radiology  
 2 in Palo Alto told plaintiff that they could not serve plaintiff  
 3 because they could not transfer him from his wheelchair onto  
 4 the MRI table. This employee told him that she could not help  
 5 him and he would have to go somewhere else for service.

6 14. Because of Valley Radiology's refusal to serve  
 7 plaintiff, he has been unable to have an MRI, and therefore has  
 8 been unable to receive appropriate and needed treatment for his  
 9 injuries, which has caused bodily injuries, pain and suffering,  
 10 all to his damages.

11 15. In addition to the discriminatory policy of refusing  
 12 to serve persons who use wheelchairs, these public facilities  
 13 are inaccessible to persons with disabilities in other aspects,  
 14 including lack of any accessible medical equipment;  
 15 inaccessible entry way and restrooms at the Mountain View  
 16 facility; and inaccessible exterior path of travel and entry  
 17 way at the Palo Alto facility, all rendering such facilities  
 18 inaccessible to and unusable by plaintiff and other mobility  
 19 disabled persons. All public facilities at the subject  
 20 properties must be brought into compliance with all applicable  
 21 federal and state code requirements for disabled access.

22 16. Further, each and every violation of the Americans  
 23 With Disabilities Act of 1990 (as pled in the Third Cause of  
 24 Action, the contents of which are replied and incorporated  
 25 herein, word for word, as if separately pled), also  
 26 constitutes a separate and distinct violation of §54(c)  
 27 California Civil Code, thus independently justifying an award  
 28

1 of damages and injunctive relief pursuant to California law,  
 2 including but not limited to §§ 54.3 and 55 Civil Code.

3       17. Further, each and every violation of the Americans  
 4 With Disabilities Act of 1990 (as pled in the Third Cause of  
 5 Action, the contents of which are replied and incorporated  
 6 herein, word for word, as if separately replied), also  
 7 constitutes a separate and distinct violation of §54.1(d)  
 8 California Civil Code, thus independently justifying an award  
 9 of damages and injunctive relief pursuant to California law,  
 10 including but not limited to §§ 54.3 and 55 Civil Code.

11       18. **INJUNCTIVE RELIEF:** Plaintiff seeks injunctive relief  
 12 to prohibit the acts and omissions of defendants as complained  
 13 of herein which are continuing on a day-to-day basis and which  
 14 have the effect of wrongfully excluding plaintiff and other  
 15 members of the public who are physically disabled wheelchair  
 16 users from full and equal access to these public facilities.  
 17 Such acts and omissions are the cause of humiliation and mental  
 18 and emotional suffering of plaintiff BRIAN BOLITHO in that  
 19 these actions continue to treat him as an inferior and second  
 20 class citizen and serve to discriminate against him on the sole  
 21 basis that he is a person with disabilities who requires the  
 22 use of a wheelchair for movement in public places. Plaintiff  
 23 is unable, so long as such acts and omissions of defendants  
 24 continue, to achieve equal access to and use of these public  
 25 facilities. The acts of defendants have proximately caused and  
 26 will continue to cause irreparable injury to plaintiff if not  
 27 enjoined by this Court.

28

1       19. Wherefore plaintiff asks this Court to preliminarily  
 2 and permanently enjoin any continuing refusal by defendants to  
 3 grant full and equal access to plaintiff in the respects  
 4 complained of and to require defendants to comply forthwith  
 5 with the applicable statutory requirements relating to access  
 6 for disabled persons, or, alternatively, to close their  
 7 inaccessible facilities to the public and cease to operate  
 8 inaccessible public accommodations. Such injunctive relief is  
 9 provided by California Health & Safety Code §19953 and  
 10 California Civil Code §55, and other law.

11       20. **DAMAGES:** As a result of the denial of equal access  
 12 to the facility and due to the acts and omissions of defendants  
 13 and each of them in owning, operating, leasing, constructing,  
 14 altering, and maintaining the subject public facilities,  
 15 plaintiff suffered a violation of his Civil Rights including  
 16 but not limited to rights under Civil Code §§ 54 and 54.1, and  
 17 suffered physical personal injuries and bodily injuries,  
 18 physical discomfort and pain, mental and emotional distress,  
 19 embarrassment and humiliation, all to his damages as  
 20 hereinafter stated. Defendants' actions and omissions to act  
 21 constitute discrimination against plaintiff on the sole basis  
 22 that he was and is physically disabled and unable, because of  
 23 the architectural barriers and discriminatory policies created  
 24 and/or maintained by the defendants in violation of the subject  
 25 laws, to use the public facilities on a full and equal basis as  
 26 other persons. Plaintiff also seeks trebling of all actual  
 27 damages, general and special, as provided by Civil Code §54.3.  
 28

1       21. **TREBLE DAMAGES:** On information and belief, defendants  
 2 have been aware prior to plaintiff's described encounters that  
 3 their denial of access and their lack of accessible facilities  
 4 at the subject property was denying "full and equal access" to  
 5 disabled persons such as plaintiff and would continue to deny  
 6 such access on a daily basis until fully accessible facilities  
 7 were provided for disabled persons. For example, defendants'  
 8 facilities have designated disabled accessible parking and  
 9 restrooms, and yet each office maintains a policy of refusing  
 10 to serve disabled wheelchair users. This conduct evidences a  
 11 conscious disregard for the rights of plaintiff and other  
 12 disabled persons, and justifies treble damages pursuant to  
 13 Civil Code §54.3.

14       22. **FEES AND COSTS:** As a result of defendants' acts and  
 15 omissions, plaintiff has been required to incur attorney fees,  
 16 litigation expenses, and costs as provided by statute, in order  
 17 to enforce plaintiff's rights and to enforce provisions of the  
 18 law protecting access for disabled persons and prohibiting  
 19 discrimination against disabled persons. Plaintiff therefore  
 20 seeks recovery of all reasonable attorney fees, litigation  
 21 expenses, and costs, pursuant to the provisions of Civil Code  
 22 §§ 54.3 and 55 and Health and Safety Code §19953.  
 23 Additionally, plaintiff's lawsuit is intended to force the  
 24 defendants to make their facilities accessible to all disabled  
 25 members of the public, justifying "public interest" attorney  
 26 fees, litigation expenses and costs pursuant to the provisions  
 27 of §1021.5 Code of Civil Procedure and other applicable law.

28

Wherefore plaintiff prays for relief as hereinafter stated:

SECOND CAUSE OF ACTION:  
VIOLATION OF UNRUH CIVIL RIGHTS ACT  
CALIFORNIA CIVIL CODE SECTIONS 51 AND 52,  
DENIAL OF FULL AND EQUAL ACCOMMODATION IN A BUSINESS  
ESTABLISHMENT ON THE BASIS OF DISABILITY

23. Plaintiff repleads and incorporates by reference, as if fully set forth again herein, the factual allegations contained in Paragraphs 1 through 22, above, and incorporates them herein by reference as if separately replied.

24. At all times herein mentioned, the Unruh Civil Rights Act, California Civil Code §51(b), provided that:

All persons within the jurisdiction of this state are free and equal, and no matter what their sex, race, color religion, ancestry, national origin, disability or medical condition are entitled to the full and equal accommodations, advantages, facilities, privileges, or services in all business establishments of every kind whatsoever.

Pursuant to California Civil Code §51(f),

A violation of the right of any individual under the Americans with Disabilities Act of 1990 (Public Law 101-336) shall also constitute a violation of this section.

25. Defendants' medical imaging offices are each a "business establishment" subject to Cal. Civil Code §51(b). Plaintiff suffered damages as above described as a result of defendants' violation of California Civil Code §§ 51(b) and 51(f) in multiple respects, including but not limited to violations of the ADA, as described in the Third Cause of Action, *infra*, the contents of which cause of action are incorporated herein as if separately replied. California Civil Code §52(a) provides that each such violation entitles plaintiff to "the actual damages, and any amount that may be

1 determined by a jury, or a court sitting without a jury, up to  
 2 a maximum of three times the amount of actual damage but in no  
 3 case less than four thousand dollars (\$4,000), and any  
 4 attorney's fees that may be determined by the court in addition  
 5 thereto..."

6 WHEREFORE, plaintiff prays for damages and injunctive  
 7 relief as hereinafter stated.

8

9

**THIRD CAUSE OF ACTION:**  
**VIOLATION OF TITLE III OF THE AMERICANS WITH**  
**DISABILITIES ACT OF 1990 (42 USC §12101FF):**  
**PROHIBITION AGAINST DISCRIMINATION IN A PLACE OF ACCOMMODATION**  
**ON THE BASIS OF DISABILITY**

12. Plaintiff repleads and incorporates by reference, as  
 13 if fully set forth again herein, the allegations contained in  
 14 Paragraphs 1 through 25 of this Complaint, and incorporates  
 15 them herein as if separately replied.

16. Pursuant to law, in 1990 the United States Congress  
 17 made findings per 42 USC §12101 regarding physically disabled  
 18 persons, finding that laws were needed to more fully protect  
 19 "some 43 million Americans [with] one or more physical or  
 20 mental disabilities;" that "historically society has tended to  
 21 isolate and segregate individuals with disabilities;" that  
 22 "such forms of discrimination against individuals with  
 23 disabilities continue to be a serious and pervasive social  
 24 problem;" that "the Nation's proper goals regarding individuals  
 25 with disabilities are to assure equality of opportunity, full  
 26 participation, independent living and economic self sufficiency  
 27 for such individuals;" and that "the continuing existence of  
 28 unfair and unnecessary discrimination and prejudice denies

1 people with disabilities the opportunity to compete on an equal  
 2 basis and to pursue those opportunities for which our free  
 3 society is justifiably famous..."

4       28. Congress stated as its purpose in passing the  
 5 Americans with Disabilities Act (42 USC §12101(b))

6           It is the purpose of this act

7           (1) to provide a clear and comprehensive national mandate  
 8 for the elimination of discrimination against individuals  
 with disabilities;

9           (2) to provide clear, strong, consistent, enforceable  
 10           standards addressing discrimination against individuals  
 with disabilities;

11           (3) to ensure that the Federal government plays a central  
 12 role in enforcing the standards established in this act on  
 behalf of individuals with disabilities; and

13           (4) to invoke the sweep of Congressional authority,  
 14 including the power to enforce the 14th Amendment and to  
 regulate commerce, in order to address the major areas of  
discrimination faced day to day by people with  
 15 disabilities. (Emphasis added)

16       29. As part of the Americans with Disabilities Act,  
 17 Public Law 101-336, (hereinafter the "ADA"), Congress passed  
 18 "Title III - Public Accommodations and Services Operated by  
 19 Private Entities" (42 USC 12181ff). The subject properties and  
 20 facilities are "private entities" which are considered "public  
 21 accommodations" for purposes of Title III (42 USC 12181(7)),  
 22 including but not limited to:

23           42 USC 12181(7)(F) "a...professional office of a  
 24 health care provider, hospital, or other service  
 establishment."

25       30. Pursuant to 42 USC §12182(a), "No individual shall be  
 26 discriminated against on the basis of disability in the full  
 27 and equal enjoyment of the goods, services, facilities,  
 28 privileges, advantages, or accommodations of any place of

1 public accommodation by any person who owns, leases, or leases  
 2 to, or operates a place of public accommodation."

3 31. Among the specific prohibitions against  
 4 discrimination were included:

5 42 USC (12182(b)(2)(A)(ii)): "A failure to make reasonable  
 6 modifications in policies, practices or procedures when such  
 7 modifications are necessary to afford such goods, services,  
 facilities, privileges, advantages or accommodations to  
 individuals with disabilities...;"

8 42 USC (12182(b)(2)(A)(iii)): "a failure to take such steps as may  
 9 be necessary to ensure that no individual with a disability is  
 excluded, denied service, segregated, or otherwise treated  
 differently than other individuals because of the absence of  
 10 auxiliary aids and services...;"

11 42 USC (12182(b)(2)(A)(iv)): "A failure to remove architectural  
 12 barriers, and communication barriers that are structural in  
 13 nature, in existing facilities... where such removal is readily  
 achievable;"

14 42 USC (12182(b)(2)(A)(v)): "Where an entity can demonstrate  
 15 that the removal of a barrier under clause (iv) is not readily  
 achievable, a failure to make such goods, services, facilities,  
 16 privileges, advantages, or accommodations available through  
 17 alternative methods if such methods are readily achievable." The acts and omissions of Defendants set forth herein were in  
 violation of Plaintiff's rights under the ADA, and the  
 regulations promulgated thereunder, 28 CFR Part 36ff.

18 32. The removal of each of the barriers complained of by  
 19 plaintiff as hereinabove alleged, was at all times herein  
 20 mentioned "readily achievable" under the standards established  
 21 by the Department of Justice, implementing Title III of the  
 22 Americans With Disabilities Act. As noted hereinabove, removal  
 23 of each and every one of the architectural barriers complained  
 24 of herein was also required under California law due to  
 25 "alterations, structural repairs, or additions." Further, on  
 26 information and belief, alterations to existing facilities  
 27 since January 26, 1993 have also independently triggered  
 28

1 requirements for removal of barriers to access for disabled  
 2 persons pursuant to 42 USC §12183.

3       33. On information and belief, as of the date of  
 4 plaintiff's encounter at the premises and the filing of this  
 5 Complaint, the premises have denied and continue to deny full  
 6 and equal access to plaintiff and to other disabled persons,  
 7 including wheelchair users, in other respects, which violated  
 8 plaintiff's rights to full and equal access and which  
 9 discriminated against plaintiff on the basis of his disability,  
 10 thus wrongfully denying to plaintiff the full and equal  
 11 enjoyment of the goods, services, facilities, privileges,  
 12 advantages and accommodations, in violation of §302 of the ADA,  
 13 42 USC §12182.

14       34. Pursuant to section 308 of the ADA [42 USC 12188ff]  
 15 plaintiff is entitled to the remedies and procedures set forth  
 16 in §204(a) of the Civil Rights Act of 1964, 42 USC 2000(a)-  
 17 3(a), as plaintiff is being subjected to discrimination on the  
 18 basis of disability in violation of this title or has  
 19 reasonable grounds for believing that he is about to be  
 20 subjected to discrimination in violation of §302 and §303 of  
 21 the ADA. On information and belief, defendants have continued  
 22 to violate the law and deny plaintiff and other disabled  
 23 persons by denying access to these public accommodations since  
 24 on or before plaintiff's encounters as previously discussed.  
 25 Pursuant to §308(a)(2), "In cases of violations of  
 26 §302(b)(2)(A)(iv) and (303(a)... injunctive relief shall  
 27 include an order to alter facilities to make such facilities

28

1 readily accessible to and usable by individuals with  
2 disabilities to the extent required by this title."

3           35. Plaintiff seeks relief pursuant to remedies set forth  
4 in §204(a) of the Civil Rights Act of 1964 (42 USC 2000(a)-  
5 3(a)), and pursuant to Federal Regulations adopted to implement  
6 the Americans with Disabilities Act of 1990. Plaintiff is a  
7 person, for purposes of the ADA (42 USC §12188), who is being  
8 subjected to discrimination on the basis of disability in  
9 violation of Title III and who has reasonable grounds for  
10 believing he will be subjected to such discrimination each time  
11 that he may attempt to use the subject properties and premises.  
12 Plaintiff remains deterred from returning to such facilities  
13 each and every day until such facilities are made accessible to  
14 disabled persons.

## PRAYER

18 Plaintiff BRIAN BOLITHO prays that this Court:

19           1. Issue a preliminary and permanent injunction  
20 directing defendants as current owners, operators, lessors,  
21 and/or lessees of the subject premises to modify the above  
22 described properties and premises and related facilities, and  
23 modify their policies and procedures so that each provides full  
24 and equal access to all citizens, including persons with  
25 disabilities; or in the alternative, directing defendants to  
26 close their facilities to the public and cease to operate as  
27 public accommodations or business establishments until such

1 time as the facilities are made accessible to persons with  
2 disabilities;

3 2. Retain jurisdiction over defendants until such time  
4 as the Court is satisfied that defendants' unlawful policies,  
5 practices, acts and omissions, and maintenance of inaccessible  
6 public facilities as complained of herein no longer occur, and  
7 cannot recur;

8 3. Award to plaintiff BRIAN BOLITHO all appropriate  
9 damages, including but not limited to statutory damages,  
10 general damages and treble damages, in an amount within the  
11 jurisdiction of the Court, all according to proof;

12 4. Award to plaintiff all reasonable attorney fees,  
13 litigation expenses, and costs of this proceeding as provided  
14 by law; and

15 5. Grant such other and further relief as this Court may  
16 deem just and proper.

17

18 Dated: November \_\_, 2004

PAUL L. REIN  
PATRICIA BARBOSA  
JULIE MCLEAN  
LAW OFFICES OF PAUL L. REIN

20

21

22

Attorneys for Plaintiff  
BRIAN BOLITHO

23

24

25

26

27

///

28

///

**DEMAND FOR JURY TRIAL**

Plaintiff hereby demands a jury for all claims for which a jury is permitted.

Dated: November , 2004

PAUL L. REIN  
PATRICIA BARBOSA  
JULIE MCLEAN  
LAW OFFICES OF PAUL L. REIN

Attorneys for Plaintiff  
BRIAN BOLITHO

**CERTIFICATION OF INTERESTED ENTITIES OR PARTIES**

13 Pursuant to Civil L.R. 3-16, the undersigned  
14 certifies that as of this date, other than the named parties,  
15 there is no such interest to report.

17 || Dated: November , 2004

PAUL L. REIN  
PATRICIA BARBOSA  
JULIE MCLEAN  
LAW OFFICES OF PAUL L. REIN

Attorneys for Plaintiff  
BRITAN BOLITHO